### Survey and Evaluation Update

### Iowa City Central Business District



Prepared for
City of Iowa City
Iowa City Historic Preservation Commission

Prepared by
Alexa McDowell
AKAY Consulting
Minneapolis, Minnesota

October 2018

### City of Iowa City

#### City Council

Mayor, Jim Throgmorton

Kingsley Botchway II Rockne Cole Susan Mims Pauline Taylor John Thomas Mazahir Salih

#### **Historic Preservation Commission**

Chair, Ginalie Swaim
Thomas Agran
Cecile Kuenzli
Frank Wagner
Pam Michaud
Esther Baker
Zachariah Builta
Sharon DeGraw
GT Karr
Kevin Boyd
Gosia S. Clore

### Neighborhood and Development Services

Bob Miklo, Senior Planner Jessica Bristow, Historic Preservation Planner Sylvia Bochner, Intern

#### **Table of Contents**

1.0	Introduction				
	Figur	re 01. Map of Project Survey Area Showing 2001 & 2018 Boundaries	02		
2.0	Methodology				
	Table 01. National Register Listed Resources in the 2018 Survey Area Table 02. National Register Listed Resources in Adjacency				
	2.1 Community Engagement				
3.0	Development Overview				
4.0	Summary of Findings and Recommendations				
	4.1	Standards of Evaluation 4.1.a Individually Eligible 4.1.b Contributing 4.1.c Non-Contributing	14 16 17 20		
	4.2 Statement of Findings		21-42		
	Table 03. Resource Evaluation Findings Figure 02. Resource Map		22-35 36		
		4.2.a Individually Eligible	37		
		Table 04. Individually Eligible Resources	37-38		
		4.2.b Historic District Eligibility	38-39		
		Figure 03. Map of Proposed Historic District Boundaries -1 Figure 04. Map of Proposed Historic District Boundaries - 2	40 41		
		4.2.c. Historic Preservation Overly Zones	42		
	4.3	Recommendations	42-43		
5.0	Historic Preservation Incentives				
	5.1	<ul> <li>5.1 Historic Tax Credit Programs</li> <li>5.1.a Iowa Historic Tax Credit Program</li> <li>5.1.b Federal Historic Tax Incentive Program</li> <li>5.1.c Iowa Historic Property Temporary Tax Exemption Program</li> </ul>			
	5.2	City of Iowa City Programs 5.2 a Tax Increment Financing	51 51 51-52		
	5.3 Iowa Downtown Resource Center Programs				
		<ul> <li>5.1.a Main Street Iowa</li> <li>5.1.b Model Communities</li> <li>5.1.c Workforce Housing Tax Credits</li> </ul>	52 52 52		

7.1 ·	
List of Tables	0.2
Table 01. National Register Listed Resources in 2018 Survey Area	03
Table 02. National Register Listed Resources Adjacent to 2018 Survey Area	04
Table 03. Resource Evaluation Findings	22
Table 04. Individually Eligible Resources	37
List of Figures	
Figure 01. Map of Project Survey Area – 2018	36
Figure 02. Map of Proposed Historic District Boundaries	40
Figure 03. Map of Proposed Historic District Boundaries Without Urban Renewal	41
List of Images	
Image 01. Franklin Printing – 115 S. Dubuque Street – 1856	06
Image 02. View of west side of S. Dubuque with 1870s era buildings	07
Image 03. The Airliner – 22 S. Dubuque Street – ca.1877/1950	08
Image 04. Englert Theatre – 221 E. Washington Street – 1913	09
Image 05. Kresge's – 119-123 E. Washington Street – 1930	10
Image 06. Eldon Miller Building (Gabe's) – 330 E. Washington Street – 1955	11
Image 07. Carnegie Public Library – 309 E. College Street – 1903	15
Image 08. Coast & Sons – 10-14 S. Clinton Street – 1895	18
Image 09. Things & Things & Things – 130 S. Clinton Street – 1970	19
Image 10. Commercial Building – 112 E. College Street – ca.1915	20
Image 11. Historic Image – E. College Street – ca.1915	21
Image 12. Before: Letts-Fletcher Company Warehouse, Marshalltown - 2011	45
Image 13. After: Letts-Fletcher Company Warehouse, Marshalltown - 2011	45
Image 14. Before: Barton-Ford Motor Company Building, Cedar Rapids – 2014	47
Image 15. After: Barton-Ford Motor Company Building, Cedar Rapids – 2016	47
Image 16. Before: Barton-Ford Motor Company Building – Interior – 2014	48
Image 17. After: Barton-Ford Motor Company Building – Interior – 2016	48
Image 18. After: Iowa State Bank & Trust – 102 S. Clinton – 2018	49
Appendices	
Appendix A. 2018 Survey Resource Table and Maps	
Amountin D. Hadatad Multiple Dogramty Decomposition Forms "Analyticational and Hi	~4~~i~~1

Appendix A.	2018 Survey Resource Table and Maps
Appendix B.	Updated Multiple Property Documentation Form "Architectural and Historical
	Resources of the Central Business District, 1856-1984"
Appendix C.	Project Presentations
Appendix D.	Iowa Historic Tax Credit Program
Appendix E.	Federal Historic Tax Credit Program
Appendix F.	Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties
Appendix G.	Jan Olive Nash, "Iowa's Main Street Commercial Architecture," MPD, 2002.

## Appendix F

•	National Register	of Historic Places	Criterion for	Evaluation o	f Significance
---	-------------------	--------------------	---------------	--------------	----------------



### NATIONAL REGISTER BULLETIN

#### How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation

Previous Table of Contents Nex

#### U.S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service

# VI. HOW TO IDENTIFY THE TYPE OF SIGNIFICANCE OF A PROPERTY

#### INTRODUCTION

When evaluated within its historic context, a property must be shown to be significant for one or more of the four Criteria for Evaluation - A, B, C, or D (listed earlier in Part II). The Criteria describe how properties are significant for their association with important events or persons, for their importance in design or construction, or for their information potential.

The basis for judging a property's significance and, ultimately, its eligibility under the Criteria is *historic context*. The use of historic context allows a property to be properly evaluated in a nearly infinite number of capacities. For instance, Criterion C: Design/Construction can accommodate properties representing construction types that are unusual or widely practiced, that are innovative or traditional, that are "high style" or vernacular, that are the work of a famous architect or an unknown master craftsman. *The key to determining whether the characteristics or associations of a particular property are significant is to consider the property within its historic context.* 

After identifying the relevant historic context(s) with which the property is associated, the four Criteria are applied to the property. Within the scope of the historic context, the National Register Criteria define the kind of significance that the properties represent.

For example, within the context of "19th Century Gunpowder Production in the Brandywine Valley," Criterion A would apply to those properties associated with important events in the founding and development of the industry. Criterion B would apply to those properties associated with persons who are significant in the founding of the industry or associated with important inventions related to gunpowder manufacturing. Criterion C would apply to those buildings, structures, or objects whose architectural form or style reflect important design qualities integral to the industry. And Criterion D would apply to properties that can convey information important in our understanding of this industrial process. If a property qualifies under more than one of the Criteria, its significance under each should be considered, if possible, in order to identify all aspects of its historical value.

### National Register Criteria for Evaluation\*\*

- 1. Criterion A: Event
- 2. Criterion B: Person
- 3. Criterion C: Design/Construction
- 4. Criterion D: Information Potential

The National Register Criteria recognize different types of values embodied in districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects. These values fall into the following categories:

**Associative value (Criteria A and B)**: Properties significant for their association or linkage to events (Criteria A) or persons (Criteria B) important in the past.

**Design or Construction value (Criterion C)**: Properites significant as representatives of the manmade expression of culture or technology. **Information value (Criterion D)**: Properties significant for their ability to yield important information about prehistory or history.

### **CRITERION A: EVENT**

Properties can be eligible for the National Register if they are associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.

### Understanding Criterion A: Event

To be considered for listing under Criterion A, a property must be associated with one or more events important in the defined historic context. Criterion A recognizes properties associated with single events, such as the founding of a town, or with a pattern of events, repeated activities, or historic trends, such as the gradual rise of a port city's prominence in trade and commerce. The event or trends, however, must clearly be important within the associated context: settlement, in the case of the town, or development of a maritime economy, in the case of the port city. Moreover, the property must have an important association with the event or historic trends, and it must retain historic integrity. (See Part V: How to Evaluate a Property Within its Historic Context.)

Several steps are involved in determining whether a property is significant for its associative values:

- Determine the nature and origin of the property,
- Identify the historic context with which it is associated, and
- Evaluate the property's history to determine whether it is associated with the historic context in any important way.

### Applying Criterion A: Event

### **Types of Events**

A property can be associated with either (or both) of two types of events:

<sup>\*\*</sup>For a complete listing of the Criteria for Evaluation, refer to Part II of this bulletin

- A specific event marking an important moment in American prehistory or history and
  - A pattern of events or a historic trend that made a significant contribution to the development of a community, a State, or the nation.

#### EXAMPLES OF PROPERTIES ASSOCIATED WITH EVENTS

Properties associated with specific events:

- *The site of a battle.*
- The building in which an important invention was developed.
- A factory district where a significant strike occurred.
- An archeological site at which a major new aspect of prehistory was discovered, such as the first evidence of man and extinct Pleistocene animals being contemporaneous.
- A site where an important facet of European exploration occurred.

Properties associated with a pattern of events:

- A trail associated with western migration.
- A railroad station that served as the focus of a community's transportation system and commerce.
- A mill district reflecting the importance of textile manufacturing during a given period.
- A building used by an important local social organization.
- A site where prehistoric Native Americans annually gathered for seasonally available resources and for social interaction.
- A downtown district representing a town's growth as the commercial focus of the surrounding agricultural area.

### **Association of the Property with the Events**

The property you are evaluating must be documented, through accepted means of historical or archeological research (including oral history), to have existed at the time of the event or pattern of events and to have been associated with those events. A property is not eligible if its associations are speculative. For archeological sites, well reasoned inferences drawn from data recovered at the site can be used to establish the association between the site and the events.

### **Significance of the Association**

Mere association with historic events or trends is not enough, in and of itself, to qualify under Criterion A: the property's specific association must be considered important as well. For example, a building historically in commercial use must be shown to have been significant in commercial history.

#### **Traditional Cultural Values**

Traditional cultural significance is derived from the role a property plays in a community's historically rooted beliefs, customs, and practices. Properties may have significance under Criterion A if they are associated with events, or series of events, significant to the cultural traditions of a community. (For more information, refer to National Register Bulletin: Guidelines for Evaluating and Documenting Traditional Cultural Properties.)

#### **Eligible**

- A hilltop associated in oral historical accounts with the founding of an Indian tribe or society is eligible.
- A rural community can be eligible whose organization, buildings, or patterns of land use reflect the cultural traditions valued by its long-term residents.
- An urban neighborhood can be eligible as the traditional home of a particular cultural group and as a reflection of its beliefs and practices.

#### Not Eligible

• A site viewed as sacred by a recently established utopian or religious community does not have traditional cultural value and is not eligible.

#### **CRITERION B: PERSON**

## Properties may be eligible for the National Register if they are associated with the lives of persons significant in our past.

(For further information on properties eligible under Criterion B, refer to <u>National Register</u> <u>Bulletin: Guidelines for Evaluating and Documenting Properties Associated with Significant Persons</u>.)

### Understanding Criterion B: Person

Criterion B applies to properties associated with individuals whose specific contributions to history can be identified and documented. Persons "significant in our past" refers to individuals whose activities are demonstrably important within a local, State, or national historic context. The criterion is generally restricted to those properties that illustrate (rather than commemorate) a person's important achievements. (The policy regarding commemorative properties, birthplaces, and graves is explained further in <a href="Part VII">Part VII</a>: How to Apply the Criteria Considerations.)

Several steps are involved in determining whether a property is significant for its associative values under Criterion B. First, determine the importance of the individual. Second, ascertain the length and nature of his/her association with the property under study and identify the other properties associated with the individual. Third, consider the property under Criterion B, as outlined below.

Properties associated with a Significant Person:

- The home of an important merchant or labor leader.
- The studio of a significant artist.
- The business headquarters of an important industrialst.

#### Applying Criterion B: Person

#### **Significance of the Individual**

The persons associated with the property must be individually significant within a historic context. A property is not eligible if its only justification for significance is that it was owned or used by a person who is a member of an identifiable profession, class, or social or ethnic group. It must be shown that the person gained importance within his or her profession or group.

#### **Eligible**

• The residence of a doctor, a mayor, or a merchant is eligible under Criterion B if the person was significant in the field of medicine, politics, or commerce, respectively.

#### Not Eligible

• A property is not eligible under Criterion B if it is associated with an individual about whom no scholarly judgement can be made because either research has not revealed specific information about the person's activities and their impact, or there is insufficient perspective to determine whether those activities or contributions were historically important.

### **Association with the Property**

Properties eligible under Criterion B are usually those associated with a person's productive life, reflecting the time period when he or she achieved significance. In some instances this may be the person's home; in other cases, a person's business, office, laboratory, or studio may best represent his or her contribution. Properties that pre- or post-date an individual's significant accomplishments are usually not eligible.

The individual's association with the property must be documented by accepted methods of historical or archeological research, including written or oral history. Speculative associations are not acceptable. For archeological sites, well reasoned inferences drawn from data recovered at the site are acceptable.

### **Comparison to Related Properties**

Each property associated with an important individual should be compared to other associated properties to identify those that best represent the person's historic contributions. The best representatives usually are properties associated with the person's adult or productive life. Properties associated with an individual's formative or later years may also qualify if it can be demonstrated that the person's activities during this period were historically significant or if no properties from the person's productive years survives.

Length of association is an important factor when assessing several properties with similar associations.

A community or State may contain several properties eligible for associations with the same important person, if each represents a different aspect of the person's productive life. A property can also be eligible if it has brief but consequential associations with an important individual. (Such associations are often related to specific events that occurred at the property and, therefore, it may also be eligible under Criterion A.)

#### **Association with Groups**

For properties associated with several community leaders or with a prominent family, it is necessary to identify specific individuals and to explain their significant accomplishments.

#### **Eligible**

- A residential district in which a large number of prominent or influential merchants, professionals, civic leaders, politicians, etc., lived will be eligible under Criterion B if the significance of one or more specific individual residents is explicitly justified.
- A building that served as the seat of an important family is eligible under Criterion B if the significant accomplishments of one or more individual family members is explicitly justified.

#### Not Eligible

- A residential district in which a large number of influential persons lived is not eligible under Criterion B if the accomplishments of a specific individual(s) cannot be documented. If the significance of the district rests in the cumulative importance of prominent residents, however, then the district might still be eligible under Criterion A. Eligibility, in this case, would be based on the broad pattern of community development, through which the neighborhood evolved into the primary residential area for this class of citizens.
- A building that served as the seat of an important family will not be eligible under Criterion B if the significant accomplishments of individual family members cannot be documented. In cases where a succession of family members have lived in a house and collectively have had a demonstrably significant impact on the community, as a family, the house is more likely to be significant under Criterion A for association with a pattern of events.

### **Association with Living Persons**

Properties associated with living persons are usually not eligible for inclusion in the National Register. Sufficient time must have elapsed to assess both the person's field of endeavor and his/her contribution to that field. Generally, the person's active participation in the endeavor must be finished for this historic perspective to emerge. (See Criteria Considerations C and G in Part VII: How to Apply the Criteria Considerations.)

#### **Association with Architects/Artisans**

Architects, artisans, artists, and engineers are often represented by their works, which are

eligible under Criterion C. Their homes and studios, however, can be eligible for consideration under Criterion B, because these usually are the properties with which they are most personally associated.

#### **Native American Sites**

The known major villages of individual Native Americans who were important during the contact period or later can qualify under Criterion B. As with all Criterion B properties, the individual associated with the property must have made some specific important contribution to history. Examples include sites significantly associated with Chief Joseph and Geronimo. (For more information, refer to <u>National Register Bulletin: Guidelines for Evaluating and Documenting Traditional Cultural Properties</u>.)

#### **CRITERION C: DESIGN/CONSTRUCTION**

Properties may be eligible for the National Register if they embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

#### Understanding Criterion C: Design/Construction

This criterion applies to properties significant for their physical design or construction, including such elements as architecture, landscape architecture, engineering, and artwork. To be eligible under Criterion C, a property must meet at least one of the following requirements:

- Embody distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction.
- Represent the work of a master.
- Possess high artistic value.
- Represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

The first requirement, that properties "embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction," refers to the way in which a property was conceived, designed, or fabricated by a people or culture in past periods of history. "The work of a master" refers to the technical or aesthetic achievements of an architect or craftsman. "High artistic values" concerns the expression of aesthetic ideals or preferences and applies to aesthetic achievement.

#### EXAMPLES OF PROPERTIES ASSOCIATED WITH DESIGN/CONSTRUCTION

Properties associated with design and construction:

• A house or commercial building representing a significant style of architecture.

- A designed park or garden associated with a particular landscape design philosophy.
- A movie theater embodying high artistic value in its decorative features.
- A bridge or dam representing technological advances.

Resources "that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction" are called "districts." In the Criteria for Evaluation (as published in the Code of Federal Regulations and reprinted in <a href="Part II">Part II</a>), districts are defined within the context of Criterion C. *Districts, however, can be considered for eligibility under all the Criteria*, individually or in any combination, as is appropriate. For this reason, the full discussion of districts is contained in <a href="Part IV">Part IV</a>: How to Define Categories of Historic Properties. Throughout the bulletin, however, districts are mentioned within the context of a specific subject, such as an individual Criterion.

#### Applying Criterion C: Design/Construction

#### Distinctive Characteristics of Type, Period, and Method of Construction

This is the portion of Criterion C under which most properties are eligible, for it encompasses all architectural styles and construction practices. To be eligible under this portion of the Criterion, a property must clearly illustrate, through "distinctive characteristics," the following:

- The pattern of features common to a particular class of resources,
- The individuality or variation of features that occurs within the class,
- The evolution of that class, or
- The transition between classes of resources.

Distinctive Characteristics: "Distinctive characteristics" are the physical features or traits that commonly recur in individual types, periods, or methods of construction. To be eligible, a property must clearly contain enough of those characteristics to be considered a true representative of a particular type, period, or method of construction.

Characteristics can be expressed in terms such as form, proportion, structure, plan, style, or materials. They can be general, referring to ideas of design and construction such as basic plan or form, or they can be specific, referring to precise ways of combining particular kinds of materials.

### Eligible

- A building eligible under the theme of Gothic Revival architecture must have the distinctive characteristics that make up the vertical and picturesque qualities of the style, such as pointed gables, steep roof pitch, board and batten siding, and ornamental bargeboard and veranda trim.
- A late Mississippian village that illustrates the important concepts in prehistoric community design and planning will qualify.

• A designed historic landscape will qualify if it reflects a historic trend or school of theory and practice, such as the City Beautiful Movement, evidencing distinguished design, layout, and the work of skilled craftsmanship.

### Not Eligible

- A commercial building with some Art Deco detailing is not eligible under Criterion C if the detailing was added merely as an afterthought, rather than fully integrated with overall lines and massing typical of the Art Deco style or the transition between that and another style.
- A designed landscape that has had major changes to its historic design, vegetation, original boundary, topography/grading, architectural features, and circulation system will not qualify.

#### Type, Period, and Method of Construction:

"Type, period, or method of construction" refers to the way certain properties are related to one another by cultural tradition or function, by dates of construction or style, or by choice or availability of materials and technology.

A structure is eligible as a specimen of its type or period of construction if it is an important example (within its context) of building practices of a particular time in history. For properties that represent the variation, evolution, or transition of construction types, it must be demonstrated that the variation, etc., was an important phase of the architectural development of the area or community in that it had an impact as evidenced by later buildings. A property is not eligible, however, simply because it has been identified as the only such property ever fabricated; it must be demonstrated to be significant as well.

### Eligible

- A building that has some characteristics of the Romanesque Revival style and some characteristics of the Commercial style can qualify if it illustrates the transition of architectural design and the transition itself is considered an important architectural development.
- A Hopewellian mound, if it is an important example of mound building construction techniques, would qualify as a method or type of construction.
- A building which illustrates the early or the developing technology of particular structural systems, such as skeletal steel framing, is eligible as an example of a particular method of construction.

### **Historic Adaptation of the Original Property**

A property can be significant not only for the way it was originally constructed or crafted, but also for the way it was adapted at a later period, or for the way it illustrates changing tastes, attitudes, and uses over a period of time.

A district is eligible under this guideline if it illustrates the evolution of historic character of a place over a particular span of time.

- A Native American irrigation system modified for use by Europeans could be eligible if it illustrates the technology of either or both periods of construction.
- An early 19th century farmhouse modified in the 1880s with Queen Anne style ornamentation could be significant for the modification itself, if it represented a local variation or significant trend in building construction or remodelling, was the work of a local master (see Works of a Master below), or reflected the tastes of an important person associated with the property at the time of its alteration.
- A district encompassing the commercial development of a town between 1820 and 1910, characterized by buildings of various styles and eras, can be eligible.

#### Works of a Master

A master is a figure of generally recognized greatness in a field, a known craftsman of consummate skill, or an anonymous craftsman whose work is distinguishable from others by its characteristic style and quality. The property must express a particular phase in the development of the master's career, an aspect of his or her work, or a particular idea or theme in his or her craft.

A property is not eligible as the work of a master, however, simply because it was designed by a prominent architect. For example, not every building designed by Frank Lloyd Wright is eligible under this portion of Criterion C, although it might meet other portions of the Criterion, for instance as a representative of the Prairie style.

The work of an unidentified craftsman is eligible if it rises above the level of workmanship of the other properties encompassed by the historic context.

### **Properties Possessing High Artistic Values**

High artistic values may be expressed in many ways, including areas as diverse as community design or planning, engineering, and sculpture. A property is eligible for its high artistic values if it so fully articulates a particular concept of design that it expresses an aesthetic ideal. A property is not eligible, however, if it does not express aesthetic ideals or design concepts more fully than other properties of its type.

### Eligible

- A sculpture in a town square that epitomizes the design principles of the Art Deco style is eligible.
- A building that is a classic expression of the design theories of the Craftsman Style, such as carefully detailed handwork, is eligible.
- A landscaped park that synthesizes early 20th century principles of landscape architecture and expresses an aesthetic ideal of environment can be eligible.
- Properties that are important representatives of the aesthetic values of a cultural group, such as petroglyphs and ground drawings by Native Americans, are eligible.

- A sculpture in a town square that is a typical example of sculpture design during its period would not qualify for high artistic value, although it might be eligible if it were significant for other reasons.
- A building that is a modest example (within its historic context) of the Craftsman Style of architecture, or a landscaped park that is characteristic of turn of the century landscape design would not qualify for high artistic value.

A Significant and Distinguishable Entity Whose Components May Lack Individual Distinction: This portion of Criterion C refers to districts. For detailed information on districts, refer to Part IV of this bulletin.

#### **CRITERION D: INFORMATION POTENTIAL**

Properties may be eligible for the National Register if they have yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.

### Understanding Criterion D: Information Potential

Certain important research questions about human history can only be answered by the actual physical material of cultural resources. Criterion D encompasses the properties that have the potential to answer, in whole or in part, those types of research questions. The most common type of property nominated under this Criterion is the archeological site (or a district comprised of archeological sites). Buildings, objects, and structures (or districts comprised of these property types), however, can also be eligible for their information potential.

Criterion D has two requirements, which must *both* be met for a property to qualify:

- The property must have, or have had, information to contribute to our understanding of human history or prehistory, and
- The information must be considered important.

Under the first of these requirements, a property is eligible if it has been used as a source of data and contains more, as yet unretrieved data. A property is also eligible if it has not yet yielded information but, through testing or research, is determined a likely source of data.

Under the second requirement, the information must be carefully evaluated within an appropriate context to determine its importance. Information is considered "important" when it is shown to have a significant bearing on a research design that addresses such areas as: 1) current data gaps or alternative theories that challenge existing ones or 2) priority areas identified under a State or Federal agency management plan.

### Applying Criterion D: Information Potential

### **Archeological Sites**

Criterion D most commonly applies to properties that contain or are likely to contain

information bearing on an important archeological research question. The property must have characteristics suggesting the likelihood that it possesses configurations of artifacts, soil strata, structural remains, or other natural or cultural features that make it possible to do the following:

- Test a hypothesis or hypotheses about events, groups, or processes in the past that bear on important research questions in the social or natural sciences or the humanities; or
- Corroborate or amplify currently available information suggesting that a hypothesis is either true or false; or
- Reconstruct the sequence of archeological cultures for the purpose of identifying and explaining continuities and discontinuities in the archeological record for a particular area.

#### **Buildings, Structures, and Objects**

While most often applied to archeological districts and sites, Criterion D can also apply to buildings, structures, and objects that contain important information. In order for these types of properties to be eligible under Criterion D, they themselves must be, or must have been, the principal source of the important information.

### **Eligible**

• A building exhibiting a local variation on a standard design or construction technique can be eligible if study could yield important information, such as how local availability of materials or construction expertise affected the evolution of local building development.

### Not Eligible

• The ruins of a hacienda once contained murals that have since been destroyed. Historical documentation, however, indicates that the murals were significant for their highly unusual design. The ruins can not be eligible under Criterion D for the importance of the destroyed murals if the information is contained only in the documentation.

### **Association with Human Activity**

A property must be associated with human activity and be critical for understanding a site's historic environment in order to be eligible under Criterion D. A property can be linked to human activity through events, processes, institutions, design, construction, settlement, migration, ideals, beliefs, lifeways, and other facets of the development or maintenance of cultural systems.

The natural environment associated with the properties was often very different from that of the present and strongly influenced cultural development. Aspects of the environment that are pertinent to human activities should be considered when evaluating properties under Criterion D.

Natural features and paleontological (floral and faunal) sites are not usually eligible under Criterion D in and of themselves. They can be eligible, however, if they are either directly

related to human activity or critical to understanding a site's historic environment. In a few cases, a natural feature or site unmarked by cultural materials, that is primarily eligible under Criterion A, may also be eligible under Criterion D, if study of the feature, or its location, setting, etc. (usually in the context of data gained from other sources), will yield important information about the event or period with which it is associated.

#### **Establishing a Historic Context**

The information that a property yields, or will yield, must be evaluated within an appropriate historic context. This will entail consulting the body of information already collected from similar properties or other pertinent sources, including modern and historic written records. The researcher must be able to anticipate if and how the potential information will affect the definition of the context. The information likely to be obtained from a particular property must confirm, refute, or supplement in an important way existing information.

A property is *not* eligible if it cannot be related to a particular time period or cultural group and, as a result, lacks any historic context within which to evaluate the importance of the information to be gained.

#### **Developing Research Questions**

Having established the importance of the information that may be recovered, it is necessary to be explicit in demonstrating the connection between the important information and a specific property. One approach is to determine if specific important research questions can be answered by the data contained in the property. Research questions can be related to property-specific issues, to broader questions about a large geographic area, or to theoretical issues independent of any particular geographic location. These questions may be derived from the academic community or from preservation programs at the local, regional, State, or national level. Research questions are usually developed as part of a "research design," which specifies not only the questions to be asked, but also the types of data needed to supply the answers, and often the techniques needed to recover the data.

### Eligible

• When a site consisting of a village occupation with midden deposits, hearths, ceramics, and stratified evidence of several occupations is being evaluated, three possible research topics could be: 1) the question of whether the site occupants were indigenous to the area prior to the time of occupation or recent arrivals, 2) the investigation of the settlement-subsistence pattern of the occupants, 3) the question of whether the region was a center for the domestication of plants. Specific questions could include: A) Do the deposits show a sequential development or sudden introduction of Ceramic Type X? B) Do the dates of the occupations fit our expectations based on the current model for the reoccupation behavior of slash-and-burn agriculturalists? C) Can any genetic changes in the food plant remains be detected?

### Not Eligible

• A property is not eligible if so little can be understood about it that it is not possible to determine if specific important research questions can be answered by data contained in the property.

#### **Establishing the Presence of Adequate Data**

To support the assertion that a property has the data necessary to provide the important information, the property should be investigated with techniques sufficient to establish the presence of relevant data categories. What constitutes appropriate investigation techniques would depend upon specific circumstances including the property's location, condition, and the research questions being addressed, and could range from surface survey (or photographic survey for buildings), to the application of remote sensing techniques or intensive subsurface testing. Justification of the research potential of a property may be based on analogy to another better known property if sufficient similarities exist to establish the appropriateness of the analogy.

#### Eligible

• Data requirements depend on the specific research topics and questions to be addressed. To continue the example in "Developing Research Questions" above, we might want to ascertain the following with reference to questions A, B, and C: A) The site contains Ceramic Type X in one or more occupation levels and we expect to be able to document the local evaluation of the type or its intrusive nature. B) The hearths contain datable carbon deposits and are associated with more than one occupation. C) The midden deposits show good floral/faunal preservation, and we know enough about the physical evolution of food plants to interpret signs that suggest domestication.

#### Not Eligible

• Generally, if the applicable research design requires clearly stratified deposits, then subsurface investigation techniques must be applied. A site composed only of surface materials can not be eligible for its potential to yield information that could only be found in stratified deposits.

### **Integrity**

The assessment of integrity for properties considered for information potential depends on the data requirements of the applicable research design. A property possessing information potential does not need to recall *visually* an event, person, process, or construction technique. It is important that the significant data contained in the property remain sufficiently intact to yield the expected important information, if the appropriate study techniques are employed.

### Eligible

• An irrigation system significant for the information it will yield on early engineering practices can still be eligible even though it is now filled in and no longer retains the appearance of an open canal.

### Not Eligible

• A plowed archeological site contains several superimposed components that have been mixed to the extent that artifact assemblages cannot be reconstructed. The site cannot be eligible if the data requirements of the research design call for the study of artifacts specific to one component.

### **Partly Excavated or Disturbed Properties**

The current existence of appropriate physical remains must be ascertained in considering a property's ability to yield important information. Properties that have been partly excavated or otherwise disturbed and that are being considered for their potential to yield additional important information must be shown to retain that potential in their remaining portions.

#### **Eligible**

• A site that has been partially excavated but still retains substantial intact deposits (or a site in which the remaining deposits are small but contain critical information on a topic that is not well known) is eligible.

### Not Eligible

- A totally collected surface site or a completely excavated buried site is not eligible since the physical remains capable of yielding important information no longer exist at the site. (See Completely Excavated Sites, below, for exception.) Likewise, a site that has been looted or otherwise disturbed to the extent that the remaining cultural materials have lost their important depositional context (horizontal or vertical location of deposits) is not eligible.
- A reconstructed mound or other reconstructed site will generally not be considered eligible, because original cultural materials or context or both have been lost.

#### **Completely Excavated Sites**

Properties that have yielded important information in the past and that no longer retain additional research potential (such as completely excavated archeological sites) must be assessed essentially as historic sites under Criterion A. Such sites must be significant for associative values related to: 1) the importance of the data gained or 2) the impact of the property's role in the history of the development of anthropology/archeology or other relevant disciplines. Like other historic properties, the site must retain the ability to convey its association as the former repository of important information, the location of historic events, or the representative of important trends.

### Eligible

• A property that has been excavated is eligible if the data recovered was of such importance that it influenced the direction of research in the discipline, as in a site that clearly established the antiquity of the human occupation of the New World.

### Not Eligible

• A totally excavated site that at one time yielded important information but that no longer can convey either its historic/prehistoric utilization or significant modern investigation is not eligible.

Previous Back to top of page Next

<u>National Register Home</u> | <u>Publications Home</u> | <u>Previous Page</u> | <u>Next</u> <u>Page</u>

Comments or Questions

JPJ